



Forced Displacement Literature Review¹

March 2020

Table of Contents

Stuck in the mud: Urban displacement and tenure security in Kabul's informal settlements ..	3
A New Challenge for Urban Planning in Turkey – Socio-Spatial Impacts of Forced Migration	4
Urban Displacement from Different Perspectives: An Overview of Approaches to Urban Displacement	6
Refugee Economies in Addis Ababa: Towards Sustainable Opportunities for Urban Communities?	6
Economic Transfers and Social Cohesion in a Refugee-Hosting Setting.....	9
Unprepared for (re)integration – Lessons learned from Afghanistan, Somalia, and Syria on Refugee Returns to Urban Areas	10
Forced Migration Review: Cities and towns.....	11
Foreword: Time for cities to take centre stage on forced migration	12
Urban internal displacement: data and evidence	12
Urban response: three principles for good practice.....	13
Urban planning for refugee housing: responding to urgent needs.....	14
Active citizenship in Athens	14
Area-based approaches: an alternative in contexts of urban displacement.....	15
Multi-stakeholder approach to urban displacement in Somalia	16
Urban planning in times of displacement: secondary cities in Ukraine and Niger.....	17
Applying camp management methods to urban displacement in Afghanistan.....	18
A citywide approach in urban Bangladesh	19
Transformative climate action in cities	19
Women refugees, leisure space and the city	20
The path of least resistance? EU cities and locally organized resettlement	21
Cities as partners: the case of Kampala	21

¹ The JDC Literature Review provides summaries of recently published research to encourage the exchange of ideas on topics related to forced displacement. The findings, interpretations and conclusions expressed in the literature included in this review are entirely those of their authors and do not necessarily represent the views of the Joint Data Center, UNHCR, the World Bank, the Executive Directors of the World Bank or the governments they represent. For convenience, the literature review contains links to websites operated by third parties. The Joint Data Center and its affiliate organizations do not represent or endorse these sites or the content, services and products they may offer, and do not guarantee the accuracy or reliability of any information, data, opinions, advice or statements provided on these sites.



Invisibility and virality in urban shelter response 22

Improving information and communication to boost inclusion and self-reliance for urban refugees 22

Pakistan’s urban refugees: steps towards self-reliance..... 23

Contested public authority in marginal urban areas: challenges for humanitarians 24

Places of refuge and risk: lessons from San Pedro Sula..... 25

A call to action: mobilising local resources in Ethiopia for urban IDPs..... 26



Stuck in the mud: Urban displacement and tenure security in Kabul's informal settlements


Mohammad Abdoh and Anna Hirsch-Holland, 2019

<https://www.internal-displacement.org/expert-opinion/stuck-in-the-mud-urban-displacement-and-tenure-security-in-kabuls-informal>

Kabul is home to over 55,000 IDPs and returned refugees living in around 55 informal settlements, characterized by poor physical condition of shelters and infrastructure, and insecure tenure of residents. This paper **examines how insecurity in housing arrangements (tenure insecurity) and differing local political and economic interests impact and prolong displacement in Kabul**. Specifically, the paper analyzes: (a) types of tenure agreements and how displaced people understand these agreements; (b) effect of tenure insecurity on durable solutions; and (c) impediments to tenure security. Findings are **based on a comparative case study analysis of three informal settlements in Kabul (accommodating primarily IDPs and returned refugees) with different types of tenure agreements and ownership claims**. The analysis is based on both qualitative data (key informant interviews and focus group discussions involving residents, land owners, government officials and adjacent host communities, as well as observations on site) and quantitative data (KIS Taskforce informal settlements profiling exercise, comprising household data collected in early 2018 from 10,472 households across 55 informal settlements).

Key findings:

- **Many residents of informal settlements have no form of tenure agreement; and those that have either statutory or customary agreements are living on disputed land.** 43 percent of Kabul's informal settlement residents live in tents, and 44 percent in mud-brick dwellings. 41 percent of residents living in tents have any kind of tenure agreement, compared to 85 percent of those living in brick or concrete dwellings.
- **Residents of informal settlements have limited knowledge about land ownership and tenure arrangements.** In nearly one quarter of all sites, an average of 45 percent of residents could not identify the landowner. 40 percent of residents did not know anything about tenure arrangements.
- In one of the three settlements, residents have managed to purchase land from the purported landowner with a written document proving their ownership. Consequently, they have been able to build permanent structures, establish a school, obtain access to a water network, and plan for the future. However, they continue to face tenure insecurity due to ongoing ambiguity over the land's true ownership.
- **In the other two settlements (more typical of informal settlements in Kabul), residents have little or no tenure security; they live in fear of eviction, prevented**



from upgrading their shelters, and not enrolling their children in school on the assumption that they may have to leave any day. Residents have been threatened with eviction, often multiple times. Eviction threats arise primarily because of the landowners' plans for future development of the sites.

The authors attribute the lack of tenure security among IDPs and returned refugees living in informal settlements to weak policy and legal frameworks for the regularization of land occupancy. Such frameworks are meant to promote durable solutions either by formalizing the stay of IDPs where they are currently living (regularization of land occupancy, upgrading of settlements, and provision of services), or through relocation to allocated state land. **This situation allows landowners to exploit the ambiguities, complexities, and weaknesses of the Afghan legal framework for their private gain,** e.g. earning substantial income from charging rent to informal settlement residents, speculatively protecting land for potential real estate development (using the presence of IDPs to protect the land until such a time as they are willing to develop it) or grabbing land from others (including the state) who may hold a claim to it.

A New Challenge for Urban Planning in Turkey – Socio-Spatial Impacts of Forced Migration


Tolga Levent

European Spatial Research and Policy, Volume 26, Issue 2 (2019)

<http://dx.doi.org/10.18778/1231-1952.26.2.06>

This study **describes the socio-spatial impacts of Syrian refugees on Turkish cities and suggests ways in which urban planning might address these impacts.** Since 2011, more than 3.6 million Syrians refugees have settled in Turkey, the majority in cities. Syrian refugees have tended to concentrate in certain cities. The first group of cities includes İstanbul, Bursa, İzmir, and Konya—important metropolitan cities with high levels of economic activity, cultural diversity, and fewer problems related to social acceptance. In these cities, refugees as a percentage of the resident population are relatively low. The second group includes cities (including Kilis, Hatay, Şanlıurfa, Gaziantep, Mersin, Adana) located close to the Syrian border.

The author identifies **four interconnected socio-spatial impacts of Syrian refugees,** which pose challenges for urban planning:

- 
- **Concentration in specific locations within a city:** Most Syrian refugees have limited financial resources and so seek out residential areas with the lowest rents (typically informal housing) and within easy reach of informal jobs. In certain locations, increase in demand for housing has led to increases in housing prices and rents.
 - **Increase in residential densities:** In neighborhoods where Syrian refugees are concentrated, densification occurs through the use of single residential units by multiple households. This leads to inadequacy of social and technical services, insufficiency of green areas and playgrounds, and diminished quality of life.
 - **Formation of new patterns of land-use:** In residential areas where Syrian refugees are concentrated, residential units are being transformed into commercial units.
 - **Production of symbolic boundaries difficult to permeate:** In cities where Syrian refugees are concentrated, informal neighborhoods emerge with high levels of ethnic concentration. Refugees are displacing existing social groups to other parts of cities. According to the author, Syrians have limited interactions with other social groups, and so it is possible to observe “symbolic boundaries which are difficult to permeate” and a “ghettoization process”. Local communities perceive that Syrian refugees are causing increases in housing rents, unemployment and crime, and that refugees are causing public health problems and consequently decreasing the quality of life for residents.

Additionally, there are several socio-economic, cultural and political barriers that limit refugees’ integration including: language barriers; legal and administrative obstacles; reduced access to social networks; reduced knowledge of the local environmental and social context; inadequacy of skills for the urban labor market; lack of representation; and discrimination and xenophobia. Moreover, social tensions and conflicts with local communities have increased.

The author asserts that **urban planning institutions have not responded to the impacts of large inflows of Syrian refugees—there have been no spatial plans or planning decisions that consider Syrian refugees.** Most Syrians are not willing to return to their country, and so it is likely that the impacts and urban problems will become protracted. The author argues that under the pressure of mass migration, **increasing urban resilience should be the main objective of urban planning.** In particular, “the existence of self-sufficient small urban areas with a predetermined level of empty housing stock might also provide suitable living conditions for migrants. These parts might help not only to absorb a certain number of migrants but also to control urban rents. This should be reflected in urban development plans since these plans are the basic outputs of urban planning.”



Urban Displacement from Different Perspectives: An Overview of Approaches to Urban Displacement

Pamela Sitko and Antonio Massella

Global Alliance for Urban Crises, 2019

<http://urbancrises.org/wp-content/uploads/2019/03/3.-Urban-Displacement-from-Different-Perspectives.pdf>

This paper **examines the approaches of local authorities, international humanitarian organizations (INGOs, UN, Red Cross Red Crescent), local civil society organizations, and built environment professionals (planners, engineers, architects and builders) in protracted urban displacement situations.** The analysis covers five urban ‘systems’: (1) economy—livelihoods, jobs and support; (2) social protection and accountability—safety nets, gender-based violence (GBV); (3) access to essential services—health, education, food; (4) built environment—homes and infrastructure (water, electricity); and (5) ecology—environment, climate change, disaster risk reduction. The paper maps and discusses the main activities of each of the various stakeholders as they pertain to each of the five urban systems. Based on their analysis, the authors conclude that:

- All efforts need to be towards integrating IDPs and refugees into urban life as quickly as possible. To achieve this, **the affected communities (host and displaced populations) need to be at the center of the consultation, planning, implementing, monitoring and evaluation stages of all programs**, from short-term interventions to long-term development operations.
- International organizations have a role to play in supporting local organizations. This includes **aligning efforts to support local authorities**. It also means **focusing on local civil society organizations** who are often overlooked, but who in reality provide on-the-ground, day-to-day support to IDPs and refugees.
- **Long-term development strategies and approaches should be introduced and mainstreamed into humanitarian and recovery interventions as early as possible** in order to ensure the smoothest transition to sustainable, locally owned and managed programs. Humanitarian and development organizations, civil society organizations and others need to continue identifying areas of convergence with local authorities in order to complement their activities, support their mandate, and reinforce their responsibilities towards displaced populations within their jurisdiction.

Refugee Economies in Addis Ababa: Towards Sustainable Opportunities for Urban Communities?

Alexander Betts, Leon Fryszler, Naohiko Omata, Olivier Sterck



Refugee Studies Centre, ODID, University of Oxford, July 2019

<https://www.rsc.ox.ac.uk/publications/refugee-economies-in-addis-ababa-towards-sustainable-opportunities-for-urban-communities>

There are 22,000 registered refugees in Addis Ababa, Ethiopia, including: 17,000 Eritrean refugees under the Out-of-Camp Policy (OCP) based on their capacity to be self-reliant; and 5,000 Somali refugees mostly under the Urban Assistance Programme (UAP) because of specific vulnerabilities that cannot be met in camps. UAP refugees receive financial assistance but OCP refugees do not. This report **examines the economic lives of refugee communities in Addis Ababa, their interactions with the host community, and prospects for a sustainable urban response.** The analysis is based on qualitative research and a survey of 2,441 refugees and members of the proximate host community, prior to the implementation of the 2019 Refugee Proclamation.

Key findings:

- **Refugee communities face extreme precarity, partly as a result of restrictions on the right to work, which leave them reliant upon the informal sector and vulnerable to exploitation.** Prior to implementation of the 2019 Refugee Proclamation, refugees have not been allowed to work or register businesses. 79 percent of Eritrean refugees and 93 percent of Somali refugees were unemployed (compared to 43 percent of the proximate host community). Among those who do work, average income levels are significantly lower than that of the proximate host community. Refugees have much worse welfare outcomes than hosts, for example in terms of mental and physical health, and child school enrollment.
- Of the tiny minority who work, 86 percent of Eritreans are employees and 14 percent are self-employed, while 57 percent of Somalis are employees and 43 percent are self-employed. Where refugee businesses do exist, they are usually unregistered, do not pay tax, were created without significant start-up capital, and rarely employ staff.
- **Refugees rely on three sets of social networks: with hosts, other refugees, and transnationally.** Hosts are generally sympathetic to refugees and some self-identify as having the same ethnic background as refugees. Ethiopians often register businesses on behalf of refugees in return for a share of the profits. They also serve as citizen 'guarantors', vouching for the ability of refugees to support themselves, a regulatory condition for OCP status. Other refugees provide forms of mutual self-help, and those with limited means often pool resources, including by living together. In the absence of work, many refugees are dependent upon remittances. **While these connections probably do not significantly raise overall welfare outcomes, they provide a crucial social safety net.**

- **Refugee communities feel a sense of boredom, idleness, and hopelessness.** They regard the lack of economic opportunity as having a detrimental effect on their physical and mental health. **Over 90 percent of refugees aspire to move onwards to Europe, North America, or Australia,** although only 60 percent believe this is realistic, and an overwhelming majority would prefer to take legal rather than illegal migration routes.

The authors argue that **creating sustainable socio-economic opportunities, including through new job creation, will be crucial in order to improve welfare outcomes and offer alternatives to onward migration.** They recommend the following:

- **Provide opportunities as well as rights.** This requires international donors and the business sector to invest in jobs creation for both refugees and the host communities.
- **Build on existing networks and social capital.** The existing socio-economic lives and strategies of the communities need to be understood as the basis for designing urban interventions.
- **Create an area-based urban program.** Developing a coherent urban refugee program is important because urban refugee numbers in Addis are likely to increase as a result of general trends in urbanization, government's commitment to expand OCP numbers, and the 2019 Refugee Proclamation's expansion of socio-economic freedoms. Such a program should include both refugees and the host community, working with Addis' municipal authorities to focus on high refugee concentration areas like Bole Mikael and Gofa.
- **Invest in urban job creation.** Investment can be made in start-up finance for small business creation; fighting corruption will lower investment risk; vocational training can be offered to increase the global competitiveness of refugee and Ethiopian labor; international donors can create infrastructure within high refugee concentration areas that can encourage investment and dynamic economies; integrated training, grants, and mentorship schemes can help build capacity in areas in which refugees and proximate hosts are currently employed. To support this, the World Bank's Economic Opportunities Programme (EOP) intended to support refugees and host communities in Ethiopia, and similar programs might be extended from the camp context to the urban environment.
- **Strengthening opportunities outside Addis.** Socio-economic opportunities, including new job creation need to be available in other parts of Ethiopia, for example by: focusing the CRRF on employment creation in the border regions that host most refugees (e.g. Dollo Ado, Shire, Gambella, and Jijiga); consider refugees within the development strategies of secondary cities within Ethiopia's other regions; and strengthen the industrial zones model envisaged by the Ethiopia 'Jobs Compact'.
- **Consider alternative migration pathways.** While not an adequate solution by itself, expanding opportunities for resettlement and alternative migration pathways could complement a primary focus on solutions within Ethiopia.



Economic Transfers and Social Cohesion in a Refugee-Hosting Setting

Elsa Valli, Amber Peterman, and Melissa Hidrobo

The Journal of Development Studies, Volume 55, Issue S1 (2019) Pages 128–146,

<https://doi.org/10.1080/00220388.2019.1687879>

This study **examines if a transfer program targeted to Colombian refugees and poor Ecuadorians in urban and peri-urban areas of northern Ecuador resulted in changes in measures of social cohesion.** The program was a short-term cash, food, and voucher program paired with nutrition training implemented over six months by WFP. The definition of social cohesion in this study is based on six aggregated indicators: (a) trust in individuals and social connectedness; (b) personal agency; (c) attitudes accepting diversity; (d) freedom from discrimination; (e) confidence in institutions; and (f) social participation. The analysis is based on a cluster randomized control trial based on surveys of over 2,000 households conducted in March-April 2011 (before the first transfers) and in October–November 2011 ('midline').

Key results:

- **The program contributed to reported improvements in social cohesion among Colombian participants** through enhanced personal agency, attitudes accepting diversity, confidence in institutions, and social participation. These effects are independent of the type of transfer (cash, food, or voucher) and accrue to all Colombian nationals, regardless of their motivation for migration (economic versus political or personal motives).
- **The program had no impact on reported social cohesion among Ecuadorian beneficiaries.**
- Two of the six dimensions of social cohesion are not affected by the treatment among either group, namely, trust in individuals and freedom from discrimination.
- There were no negative impacts of the program on the indicators or domains analyzed.

The authors hypothesize that these impacts are driven by the joint targeting of Colombians and Ecuadorians, the interaction between these national groups at monthly nutrition sessions, and the messaging around social inclusion by program implementers. The authors conclude that **even short-term social protection schemes hold promise for positively affecting social cohesion between refugees and host populations.**



Unprepared for (re)integration – Lessons learned from Afghanistan, Somalia, and Syria on Refugee Returns to Urban Areas

Danish Refugee Council (DRC), International Rescue Committee (IRC), Norwegian Refugee Council (NRC), Samuel Hall

<https://www.samuelhall.org/publications/redss-unprepared-for-reintegration-lessons-learned-from-afghanistan-somalia-and-syria-on-refugee-returns-to-urban-areas>


This report **examines refugee return and reintegration in urban areas of Afghanistan, Somalia and Syria**. The analysis is based on key informant interviews, focus group discussions, household case studies, operational case studies, and a literature review.

Key points:

- Returnees often move to urban areas when they cannot find opportunities or security elsewhere.
- Returnees who move to urban areas that are not their place of origin face increased integration challenges. Fostering social capital in these contexts is crucial to facilitating access to livelihoods and improving social cohesion, mental health and overall wellbeing.
- Limited land and housing are major impediments to reintegration.

The report **presents ten lessons learned to reinforce preparedness for returnees**:

- **Defining who is a returnee and when a situation is conducive to returns.** The refugee returnee definition should be widened to include those who do not have official refugee status, those whose temporary protection status may have expired, and those who may require protection under the principle of non-refoulement. Protection thresholds for organized returns are required to enhance pre-planning and for determining when situations are conducive to returns and to the engagement of humanitarian actors.
- **Improving information sharing with refugees and returnees.** Refugee representatives should be provided with opportunities for go-and-see visits. Return packages should include a stronger information component to address the need for accessible, tailored and unbiased information on conditions in the country, as well as information on documentation and bureaucratic processes.
- **Better hosting for better reintegration.** The types of skills and work experience gained in asylum countries influence access to opportunities upon return. More work is required



to make the link between refugee experiences in host countries and better reintegration, and to make this a priority for development actors.

- **Building on regional agreements to bolster responsibility sharing.** There are several shortcomings of tripartite agreements between host countries, origin countries and UNHCR (that only cover documented refugees and lack refugee representation). More needs to be done to integrate refugee representation, voices and influence in the decisions that affect them.
- **Designing cross-border approaches.** Joint cross-border programming can allow stakeholders to work with the same cohort, and to provide coordinated programming that follows a group of people through their return journey to their reintegration.
- **Planning local responses with a focus on housing, land and property (HLP).** There are gaps in urban planning in contexts of return. Urban planning often fails to integrate the displaced or the informal settlements in which they live. HLP assistance is central to preventing land-related conflict and to supporting inclusion for returnees. Rental subsidies can be better adapted to urban areas, in certain cases, than land allocation, as piloted in Mogadishu.
- **Prioritizing urban and community plans.** Initiatives are underway to strengthen the voices and inclusion of displacement-affected communities, and to make those voices heard by decision-makers, e.g. the establishment of a common social accountability platform in Somalia. Integrated approaches under a 'one settlement plan' are required to turn land-based solutions into stepping stones for durable solutions, focusing on housing, rather than shelter, and on configured, planned and connected city extensions.
- **Investing in locally led approaches to economic reintegration.** Economic reintegration programming has focused disproportionately on technical and vocational education and training (TVET), while links to markets and socio-economic inclusion have been overlooked.
- **Closing monitoring and data gaps after return.** There is still a lack of evidence and learning regarding the quality and impact of reintegration programming.
- **Defining the nexus between humanitarian action, development and peacebuilding in return settings.**

Forced Migration Review: Cities and towns

Refugee Studies Centre, Oxford Department of International Development

Forced Migration Review, Issue 63, February 2020

<https://www.fmreview.org/cities>



Foreword: Time for cities to take centre stage on forced migration

Marvin Rees

Forced Migration Review, Issue 63, February 2020

www.fmreview.org/cities/rees

The mayor of Bristol makes the following points in the foreword to this issue of FMR:

- The majority of refugees are living in urban areas. Cities are on the frontline of receiving and integrating the forcibly displaced.
- Cities are finding new ways to make the inclusion of refugees a reality, recognizing the contributions that refugees can make for the benefit of all residents.
- Concerted efforts are needed to increase the profile and influence of cities in the global mechanisms that govern and enable human mobility.
- The Marrakech Mayors Declaration, 'Cities working together for migrants and refugees' sets out the commitments of cities and also calls for them to play a meaningful role in the implementation and evaluation of the global compacts on migrants and refugees.
- The Mayors Migration Council, a global initiative to support cities to become more influential at the global level, will drive future work.

Urban internal displacement: data and evidence

Vicente Anzellini and Clémence Leduc

Forced Migration Review, Issue 63, February 2020

www.fmreview.org/cities/anzellini-leduc

This article **discusses the challenges of collecting data on urban internal displacement, and how some of these challenges might be overcome**. Key points:

- There is a persistent lack of accurate estimates of the scale of urban displacement.
- This reflects several challenges, including: (a) lack of consensus on what constitutes an urban area; (b) difficulties obtaining geo-located data on IDPs in urban areas (due to dynamic population movements, dispersal of IDPs, and the desire of many IDPs to remain anonymous); and (c) lack of longitudinal data.
- There are some examples of detailed geo-located data on IDPs, e.g. IOM has collected geo-located data on all IDP sites in Iraq. The data reveals that 70 percent of IDPs are in urban areas and 90 percent of rural IDP sites are within 10 km of an urban center.

- Alternative data sources and technologies (e.g. mobile phone data, satellite imagery analysis, community mapping) could help to overcome these challenges.
- Profiling exercises can shed light on the impacts of displacement on urban IDPs and hosts, as well as the capacity of local authorities and other stakeholders to respond.
- Sustaining data collection and analysis efforts over time can be challenging. Therefore, capacity development of local authorities and the participation of urban IDPs and host communities in data collection are essential, e.g. 2014-15 profiling of informal settlements in Mogadishu in collaboration with local authorities.

Urban response: three principles for good practice

David Sanderson

Forced Migration Review, Issue 63, February 2020

www.fmreview.org/cities/sanderson

This article summarizes the findings of a ‘Good Practice Review’, undertaken for ODI and ALNAP, which **identifies three principles for good practice in urban humanitarian responses**:

1. **Take the long-term view.** Many short-term measures can have long-term impacts, e.g. decision about where to situate a ‘temporary’ camp that in time becomes permanent. In Jordan and Lebanon, several aid organizations are addressing shelter needs of Syrian refugees by working with landlords to upgrade properties. Area-based approaches also take a long-term view by engaging local actors (displaced and hosts) and employing coordinated, cross-sectoral approaches to neighborhood upgrading. However, area-based approaches are not without problems, e.g. a 2016-17 initiative in Bangui, CAR faced challenges around coordination, limited local capacities, and limited resources.
2. **Engage with complexity.** People-centered approaches (focused on skills, abilities and social networks) and systems-oriented approaches (to describe the interconnected nature of the elements of city life, such as markets, economies and infrastructure) are useful in urban contexts. Relevant tools include: (a) context analysis, e.g. the [Emergency Market Mapping Analysis \(EMMA\) toolkit](#); (b) multi-sectoral assessments that cover displaced and hosts, geared towards identifying the most vulnerable; and (c) profiling.
3. **Collaborate**, with local actors and between humanitarian organizations. City authorities are often ignored by international agencies, and there is a lack of city-level multi-stakeholder coordination mechanisms, which contributes to a “divergence between international and local actors”. Urban humanitarian action must be undertaken in close collaboration with authorities if it is to be effective, e.g. by adhering to the structures and regulations of existing municipal planning, and not creating parallel structures.



Urban planning for refugee housing: responding to urgent needs

Jessica Sadye Wolff

Forced Migration Review, Issue 63, February 2020

www.fmreview.org/cities/wolff

This article **discusses how the city of Hamburg adjusted its urban planning policy to accommodate refugees, and the implications of their approach.** The settlement of 82,000 refugees in Hamburg (a city of 1.8 million people) between 2015 and 2019 exacerbated an already limited social housing stock and the city had insufficient locations for new development to accommodate arriving refugees. To enable accelerated housing development, the Federal Building Code was amended to allow the construction of temporary refugee accommodation in non-residential areas, including industrial areas, car parks and commercial sites, for a period of three to five years.

However, Hamburg's city government increasingly established housing sites in more remote locations across the city, limiting opportunities for integration and interactions with local residents. There was widespread pushback from local residents who objected to large developments for refugees in their neighborhoods and the lack of customary public engagement processes. To avoid delays caused by legal proceedings launched by residents, city planners intentionally started to locate more refugee housing sites in poorer neighborhoods, with the expectation that local residents either could not or would not be willing to pursue a legal objection.


In comparison with other urban refugee housing programs that offer rental subsidies or incentives for incremental development, **Hamburg's use of urban planning regulations to provide temporary and long-term housing is noteworthy, because it increases the social housing stock, benefiting both refugees and local residents.** The author emphasizes that **urban planners can have a positive impact on refugee integration by influencing the spatial distribution of housing.**

Active citizenship in Athens

Kareem Alkabbani, Wael Habbal and Tom Western

Forced Migration Review, Issue 63, February 2020

www.fmreview.org/cities/alkabbani-habbal-western



This article **describes the work of the Syrian and Greek Youth Forum (SGYF), which supports community-building activities among refugees, asylum seekers, second-generation Syrians and Greek nationals**, with the goal of helping communities become active citizens.

The projects are very diversified. At the community level, the activists are representing refugees in numerous political and cultural fora. At the individual level, they have set up several initiatives to empower members of the Syrian community and facilitate the recognition of their rights. Examples of these activities include the provision of language courses and skill development programs, the organization of beach and street cleaning sessions as well as the participation in political inclusion campaigns and cultural festivals

Area-based approaches: an alternative in contexts of urban displacement

James Schell, Mohamed Hilmi and Seki Hirano


Forced Migration Review, Issue 63, February 2020

www.fmreview.org/cities/schell-hilmi-hirano

This article **discusses the use of area-based approaches, complementary to the current humanitarian architecture, to address urban displacement**. Area-based approaches typically involve: (a) the **targeting of geographic areas** with high levels of need, delineated by physical, social or administrative boundaries; (b) a **multi-sectoral** approach that takes into account the needs, capacities and access to services across all sectors; (c) an **inclusive** approach that considers all population groups in that location (host, displaced, returnees, poor and those with specific vulnerabilities); and (d) **participatory** modalities, involving all actors present or operating in that location (local authorities, local civil society and service providers, international organizations etc.). The Urban Settlements Working Group (USWG) has compiled and analyzed over 30 case studies, more than a third of which explicitly address the impacts of displacement in cities and towns.

Key recommendations include:

- **Creating platforms for a common approach.** Such platforms would convene actors operating in different sectors, including national/international humanitarian and development actors and local authorities. Area-based or multi-sectoral urban working groups are not necessarily bound by decisions to activate or deactivate individual clusters/sectors, and so can play an important role in the long-term transition to recovery and stabilization. They can also support existing city governance structures. However, since they are not part of the established humanitarian coordination architecture, it may be difficult to secure the financial and human resources needed to support them.



Platforms do not necessarily operate in isolation from the current humanitarian coordination architecture, and there are examples of the sector/cluster-led system being adapted to reflect this approach, e.g. tri-cluster system (initially shelter, WASH and health, later expanded to education and protection) in Mogadishu to improve settlement planning and the provision of integrated services from multiple sectors.

- **Improving social cohesion.** Area-based approaches have been used to try to reduce tensions and inequalities and to improve social cohesion, e.g. an area-based program implemented by CARE International Lebanon in Tripoli, and an area-based program implemented by UN-HABITAT in Afghanistan.

Multi-stakeholder approach to urban displacement in Somalia

Mohamed Taruri, Laura Bennison, Shezane Kirubi and Aude Galli

Forced Migration Review, Issue 63, February 2020

www.fmreview.org/cities/taruri-bennison-kirubi-galli

This article **highlights several collaborative, multi-stakeholder responses in Somalia's cities**, which provide insights into how different actors can work together to provide a coordinated response to the challenges of urban displacement through inclusive, community-led processes.

Key points:

- The UN and NGOs have supported the **establishment of coordination forums and planning processes at district/municipal level** (e.g. technical durable solutions working groups in Baidoa and Kismayo, and a durable solutions unit in Mogadishu).
- Traditional sector-based programs targeting individuals based on their displacement status are no longer appropriate, given the similar challenges faced by the displaced and the urban poor. Consequently, the UN and NGOs developed **principles to guide the transition to integrated area-based programming**, which were endorsed by the Federal Government. An example is the approach established by the World Bank, RE-INTEG and Danwadaag to support the Banadir Regional Administration, where communities face forced evictions, increases in land prices, and weak municipal capacity to respond. The Bank intends to map IDP settlements, identify public land for resettlement, and explore rental subsidy options.
- Most IDPs are from poor, low-status, southern Somali agricultural communities, and are changing city demographics in ways that challenge exclusivist clan claims. **A key challenge is how to foster social cohesion between urban displaced and host**



communities in a politically and ethnically divided context. Participatory, inclusive and transparent processes are essential.

- In Kismayo and Baidoa, **Community Action Plans were prepared reflecting needs identified by displaced and host communities, which were then consolidating into integrated district-level plans.** In Banadir Regional Administration, radio was used to build dialogue and gather public opinion on issues related to durable solution.
- Analysis of examples of emerging good practice to support inclusive, community-led processes at municipal level suggests that: **a comprehensive mapping of community structures should be conducted at the outset of interventions; opportunities to engage displacement-affected communities in project monitoring should be explored; consideration should also be given to the provision of block grants to displacement-affected community forums and groups to implement their own priorities; social cohesion and inclusion should be key strategic objectives of urban programming.**

Urban planning in times of displacement: secondary cities in Ukraine and Niger


Jeremy Wetterwald and Louise Thaller

Forced Migration Review, Issue 63, February 2020

www.fmreview.org/cities/wetterwald-thaller

Urban displacement can have a significant impact on secondary towns and cities, as demonstrated by the experiences of municipalities in southeastern Niger and eastern Ukraine. In both cases, local authorities struggle to respond to the increased demand for public services, due to a lack of resources allocated by central/regional authorities as well as disruptions to the rule of law. The author argues that **fast tracking of urban development and service improvements requires a better understanding of how to direct assistance where it is most relevant, and the mainstreaming of urban migration and displacement responses in local development strategies.** Area-based approach (ABA) assessments can enable a shared understanding of priorities and can provide an analytical framework for multi-sectoral plans. For example:

- Support to municipalities in Diffa was initiated by launching an ABA in four urban centers where resettlement neighborhoods were being built. The ABA assessment identified which basic services would be accessible to current and future residents, explored how access to basic amenities could be enhanced based on projections of future needs and current absorptive capacities, and clarified the challenges relating to supply and demand for basic services.

- 
- In eastern Ukraine, an ABA assessment in the government-controlled peripheries of large non-government controlled urban centers helped facilitate a shared understanding between key stakeholders of how communities have reorganized after the physical separation created by the conflict.

Applying camp management methods to urban displacement in Afghanistan

Anna Hirsch-Holland

Forced Migration Review, Issue 63, February 2020

www.fmreview.org/cities/hirschholland

The shift to out-of-camp urban displacement presents a particular challenge to agencies working within the camp management sector. A desk review, conducted by the Camp Coordination and Camp Management (CCCM) Cluster in 2014, found that the **camp management approach addresses needs that are just as pertinent in out-of-camp settings**, including: access to information and feedback mechanisms; structures for community participation and self-management; and coordination between multiple stakeholders to ensure efficient and effective service delivery. The NRC was one of the first agencies to pilot approaches that draw on the skill set of camp management, including in Afghanistan where it targeted urban neighborhoods in and around the eastern cities of Jalalabad, Asadabad and Mihtarlam. There were three inter-linking components: community outreach teams, community centers, and neighborhood committees. Some encouraging results emerged including: improved access to information among neighborhood residents; vulnerable beneficiaries matched with available services and protection; additional service provision for individuals and communities that might otherwise have been left behind; and strengthened participation of community members in the planning and implementation of development initiatives.

The authors identify the following challenges and lessons learned including: (1) lack of clarity in the humanitarian architecture with regard to coordination of the out-of-camp displacement response; (2) the need for a narrow geographical remit, which poses challenges for scalability; and (3) the challenge of engaging with local and national authorities. The author concludes that the adaptation of the camp management approach to urban out-of-camp contexts is a work in progress, but experience from Afghanistan shows that its practical methods for enhancing two-way communication, structured community participation and localized multi-sectoral coordination could provide the key to addressing some of the most pressing challenges of displacement in towns and cities.



A citywide approach in urban Bangladesh

Bipasha Dutta

Forced Migration Review, Issue 63, February 2020

www.fmreview.org/cities/dutta

This article **discusses the lessons learned from a citywide approach to reduce the prevalence of child labor and to protect working children's rights in four cities in Bangladesh**. World Vision targeted around 89,000 internally displaced children in four cities (Dhaka, Chittagong, Sylhet and Khulna) from 2016 to 2018. The approach was rolled out at different levels of city administration (neighborhood, district and national) and was based on partnerships and collaboration, promoting local community support mechanisms and drawing on the knowledge and feedback gained from those neighborhood activities to undertake advocacy at district and national policy levels. The citywide approach resulted in approximately 70,000 children either returned to school (if aged below 14) or continuing to work but in better jobs (those aged 14 or above). Families benefited from vocational training and income-generating activities. On average, household income increased by 15 percent.


This approach offers lessons for others involved in urban programming. However, several challenges were encountered: (1) dynamic population movements; (2) the preference among the most vulnerable IDPs for direct cash support rather than capacity building and skills training; and (3) efforts by the child labor protection committees to address abuse (both of child employment law, and physical and sexual abuse of children) were not very effective in cases where the abuser was an influential person. The authors suggest, as a way to mitigate these challenges: (a) allocating more time at the neighborhood level before carrying forward activities at district and national levels, rather than attempting interventions at three levels simultaneously; (b) building awareness among government representatives and service providing agencies of the importance of social and institutional development; and (c) better advocacy and follow up to engage influential stakeholders.

Transformative climate action in cities

François Gemenne, Caroline Zickgraf, Anneliese Depoux, Laetitia Pettinotti, Agathe Cavicchioli and Sarah Rosengaertner

Forced Migration Review, Issue 63, February 2020

www.fmreview.org/cities/gemenne-zickgraf-depoux-pettinotti-cavicchiolirosegaertner



This article **unpacks how climate change will affect migrant populations living in cities (including refugees and IDPs), and how local governance and actions to combat the effects of climate change will address migrants' vulnerability and support their inclusion in cities.** In cities and metropolitan areas, the economic, social, political and geographical marginalization of migrants affects their abilities to cope with slow-onset and sudden shocks resulting from climate change. The inclusion of urban migrants in climate change adaptation planning, disaster risk reduction and preparedness and in relief programs is therefore critical. The authors propose a threefold research agenda on: the impact of forced migration on critical climate action sectors; the specific vulnerabilities of forced migrant populations; and the shared vulnerabilities and opportunities for making common cause among forced migrants and other vulnerable populations in urban areas

Women refugees, leisure space and the city

Sarah Linn

Forced Migration Review, Issue 63, February 2020

www.fmreview.org/cities/linn

The author **highlights key findings of her research on Syrian refugees' gendered experiences of mobility, security and public space in neighborhoods in the cities of Amman and Beirut.** A number of intersecting structural and identity issues have combined to create obstacles to women's access to public spaces and enjoyment of leisure opportunities, including: societal and cultural norms governing their presence and mobility in public spaces; vulnerability to verbal, sexual and physical harassment; lack of money, which hinders their mobility; perceptions that leisure spaces within refugees' immediate neighborhoods were neglected and unsafe; and tensions between refugees and host communities. Consequently, many women spent their leisure time in seclusion.

The author argues that people need spaces that are green and accessible, in close proximity to their neighborhoods, well lit and, if required, monitored to ensure petty vandalism and sexual harassment are discouraged. The author recommends that **urban planners prioritize those areas of the city that are under intense social change, highly resource compromised and suffering environmental pollution.** Spatial mapping—to discover the way in which refugees access various spaces in the city—can help planners and NGOs consider the ways and means by which women use space, how they feel when navigating public spaces and why they avoid certain spaces.



The path of least resistance? EU cities and locally organized resettlement

Tihomir Sabchev and Moritz Baumgärte

Forced Migration Review, Issue 63, February 2020

www.fmreview.org/cities/sabchev-baumgartel

This article **highlights efforts being made by some EU cities to locally organize resettlement for refugees**. For example, in Italy, a project led by the church organization Community of Sant' Egidio organizes the resettlement of 750 refugees each year through its Humanitarian Corridors initiative. Refugees receive reception and integration assistance from a large network of local church associations, civil society, NGOs and families. The authors argue that the expansion of these initiatives by local governments could represent the path of least resistance to more far-reaching reforms of the EU migration governance system. So far they have not been challenged politically or legally. The authors **suggest that cities are the logical sites for the development of sustainable refugee resettlement schemes** because: (1) local authorities are in a position to assess, easily and accurately, local capacity to host and integrate refugees; (2) many local authorities have gained significant expertise in managing refugee reception and integration and are willing to continue investing in this field; and (3) local governments have begun to collaborate directly with UN organizations and NGOs and can build on these relationships.


Cities as partners: the case of Kampala

Samer Saliba and Innocent Silver

Forced Migration Review, Issue 63, February 2020

www.fmreview.org/cities/saliba-silver

The authors (from the IRC and Kampala Capital City Authority) argue that **more needs to be done to support city governments to address displacement**. This means going beyond offering cities a seat at the table in policy discussions to investing in cities as equal partners in responses to displacement and empowering them to plan for future displacement and growth. While Kampala (which hosts an estimated 100,000 refugees) is a member of international initiatives such as the Mayors Migration Council and the Global Alliance, humanitarian actors have only just begun to view its city authority as a viable partner. Since beginning to engage with the IRC in 2017, the city authority has significantly increased its coordination with humanitarian, development and private sector partners to support the city's marginalized and displaced residents. The urban response calls for a longer, developmental approach, particularly in increasing access to housing, health care, education and livelihood



opportunities for refugees and the urban poor living in informal settlements. The authors recommend that the international humanitarian community:

- **Partner with city governments in policy and in practice:** engage in dialogue with local municipal authorities; earmark 25 percent of grant funding related to urban displacement for city government collaboration and/or local capacity strengthening, in compliance with the commitments of the Grand Bargain; and include city governments as core constituents in the implementation of the global compacts and SDGs.
- **Use humanitarian interventions to support urban development outcomes.** This means taking a community- or area-based and multi-sectoral approach to programming, while also engaging in meaningful partnerships with other organizations.

Invisibility and virality in urban shelter response

Jennifer Ward George and David Hodgkin

Forced Migration Review, Issue 63, February 2020

www.fmreview.org/cities/wardgeorge-hodgkin


The authors argue that **humanitarian shelter responses should prioritize flexibility in order to accommodate diverse needs and capacities, particularly in the urban environment**. The success of shelter assistance programs depends on: (1) flexibility (rather than adaptability); (2) invisibility of the final response within the urban landscape; and (3) virality, i.e. how well the program resonates and self-propagates. Flexibility is evident in shelter programs in Tacloban in the Philippines ('shopping list' of shelter typologies) and in Palu in Indonesia (cash grants and technical assistance to address community shelter needs through a range of diverse options). The authors identify several constraints on flexibility, including the ambition to engineer perfect shelter solutions and misconceptions of equity, which can limit the number of households assisted. Moreover, invisibility is constrained by the alignment of shelter programs with donor requirements, pre-set architectural/engineering notions of what is correct, mandates of implementing organizations, and responders' other priorities.

Improving information and communication to boost inclusion and self-reliance for urban refugees

Laura Buffoni and Gail Hopkins

Forced Migration Review, Issue 63, February 2020

www.fmreview.org/cities/buffoni-hopkins



A major obstacle to urban refugees' self-reliance is that information and refugees do not easily 'find' each other. Refugees can become isolated and 'lost' in the urban environment, partly because they relocate frequently, making contact difficult to maintain, and partly because they join impoverished, forgotten local communities at the city's margins. This causes barriers to inclusion and creates a 'hard-to-reach' population.

A community-led assessment of information and communication needs piloted by UNHCR in Eastleigh, Nairobi between January and April 2019 and co-designed with a small group of urban refugees revealed:

- Refugees felt that they had few mechanisms to provide feedback to UNHCR and partners, and wanted a two-way information flow similar to what is more easily sustained in camps.
- Refugees lacked information on available local services (how to access food, medical care, training, education and employment) and where to obtain help after an attack or harassment. This was often due to illiteracy, or posters in the wrong languages or in places not frequented by refugees.
- Refugees requested local, centralized information points for information on the location and source of services.
- Refugees suggested formalizing NGO-trained community counselors through paid employment and certification, which could facilitate a two-way information flow.
- Refugees are not often able or permitted to use social centers or local resources designed for Kenyans.
- Specific needs highlighted by the respondents included medical services, access to UNHCR, resettlement and employment.


Pakistan's urban refugees: steps towards self-reliance

Muhammad Abbas Khan, Commissionerate for Afghan Refugees, Pakistan

Forced Migration Review, Issue 63, February 2020

www.fmreview.org/cities/abbaskhan

Sixty-eight percent of Afghan refugees in Pakistan live outside of camps, mostly in and around major urban centers. Almost all urban refugees in Pakistan are engaged in livelihood activities (transport business, gemstone trading, carpet production), making a contribution to the urban economy. Urban refugees face a number of challenges including: negative perceptions of refugees as criminals and a burden on the economy; impediments to accessing education; friction between host and refugee communities due to competition over



limited resources; and 'hosting fatigue'. The author highlights the Refugee-Affected and Hosting Areas programme (RAHA), which provides support to refugee-hosting communities across different sectors such as health, education, skills development, water and sanitation, environment and social protection, and which has created a lot of good will towards refugees living in urban areas.

Contested public authority in marginal urban areas: challenges for humanitarians

Dolf J H te Lintelo, Hart Ford, Tim Liptrot, Wissam Mansour and Aline Rahbany


Forced Migration Review, Issue 63, February 2020

www.fmreview.org/cities/telintelo-ford-liptrot-mansour-rahbany

In Lebanon and Jordan, the international community is increasingly shifting support from national governments to municipalities, in recognition of the critical role they play in responding to forced displacement, and as part of a broader localization agenda. Large numbers of Syrian refugees have settled in informal urban settlements, including Palestinian camps and unofficial gatherings. Municipal authorities tend to have little or no presence in these areas, and this vacuum is filled by de facto governance actors (e.g. traditional leaders, tribal networks, influential individuals, criminal gangs, labor brokers, militias, faith-based groups and local committees). The authors' research suggests that **the localization agenda currently fails to take proper account of influential local governance actors**, which impedes the ability of humanitarian organizations to broker support for highly vulnerable populations living in these areas.

The authors identify **five key recommendations for designing and implementing humanitarian and development interventions in complex, low-income urban areas**:

- **Undertake a strong context analysis**, at local area or neighborhood level including stakeholder mapping, analysis and simultaneous equal engagement with state and non-state actors.
- **Communicate with communities to build consensus on program objectives**. The order in which stakeholders are engaged is important and can close doors later if missteps are made early on.
- **Foster greater dialogue between implementing partners and donors**. Donors could offer more practical guidance on how to operate with non-state public authorities that are deemed to exclude certain groups, and provide greater clarity on 'red lines' in the case of proscription policies.
- **Place greater emphasis on the role of the UN Humanitarian Coordinator**.

- 
- **Support primary data collection**, to generate deeper knowledge of the impact of humanitarian and development interventions on the legitimacy of state and non-state actors governing low-income informal urban settings.

Places of refuge and risk: lessons from San Pedro Sula

Yolanda Zapata

Forced Migration Review, Issue 63, February 2020

www.fmreview.org/cities/zapata

The metropolitan area of San Pedro Sula hosts approximately 40 percent of Honduras' IDPs, with the city itself hosting around 22 percent of IDPs. 81 percent of IDPs have been displaced from elsewhere in the city. IDPs tend to seek refuge in the most marginalized or lower-middle class areas of the city, characterized by limited access to basic rights and public services, and by high levels of violence (including restrictions on mobility, extortion, forced involvement of children and youth in criminal organizations, homicides and sexual violence).

Since 2016, UNHCR has been providing technical assistance to municipal authorities and communities for the development of displacement prevention and protection mechanisms. This has included working with municipal authorities to design methodologies and strategies that promote rapprochement and dialogue with high-risk communities and neighborhoods. Lessons learned include:

- **In contexts of urban violence, the time required can be doubled or even tripled by the security risks** associated with the presence of organized criminal groups, the invisible nature of displacement and the normalization of violence.
- **Access to services is best achieved through investments that benefit the entire community.**
- **Mapping and working with community actors** who are not perceived as actively contesting the criminal structures and gangs (e.g. religious leaders, leaders of community development structures and social program volunteers) is key to establishing and preserving access.
- It is important to **support community structures and civil society organizations that provide services** (e.g. church medical clinics, support programs for educational and youth community centers, nurseries and women's networks).

- **Ensuring that community interventions are integrated into municipal processes and structures can help ensure greater sustainability.**
- **It is critical to use area-based approaches** that allow the design of responses that consider the specific spatial context, the needs of the population, and coordination with other local actors, including private sector actors.

A call to action: mobilising local resources in Ethiopia for urban IDPs

Evan Easton-Calabria, Delina Abadi and Gezahegn Gebremedhin

Forced Migration Review, Issue 63, February 2020

www.fmreview.org/cities/eastoncalabria-abadi-gebremedhin

In 2018, about 1,300 registered IDP households and many unregistered IDPs fled ethnic conflict in the Somali region of Ethiopia to seek safety in Adama, the capital of the Oromia region. The city government led a successful multi-level response that included action by sectoral government bureaus, private sector actors, kebeles (districts), community-based associations, NGOs and individuals.

- City and regional government used the media—TV and social media—to appeal for support, or approached the private sector directly. Successful communication came from ‘cascading’ a single message through federal, regional and local government.
- The local private sector donated cash, basic necessities such as food and blankets, and steel roofs, cement, iron bars and sand for the construction of houses. Some even sponsored the building of multiple houses. Free media coverage in exchange for donations played a huge role in successfully mobilizing funds.
- Local NGOs offered IDPs basic necessities and especially targeted women, mothers and children.
- In addition to donating cash, clothing and other material support, local individuals cooked hot meals for the IDPs for several days. Some Idirs (informal institutions established between neighbors, families or friends) also stepped in to offer support.

Over \$1 million was raised in the span of just a few months, without international assistance. The response led to the construction of 2,000 houses in which 1,340 registered IDP households and about 500 IDP minors have settled. However, it was more difficult to facilitate other needs such as employment, which require ongoing relationships and the availability of certain skills.